



**Gavin Newsom
Mayor**

**Philip A. Ginsburg
Human Resources Director**

DATE: May 30, 2006

TO: Philip A. Ginsburg
Director

FROM : Donna Kotake
Workforce Development Director

SUBJECT: FINAL REPORT ON THE STATUS OF CITYWIDE PERFORMANCE PLANNING & APPRAISALS

To begin the implementation of the Mandatory Performance Planning and Appraisal (“PPA”) Program, a survey was sent to all City departments regarding PPAs in December, 2005. The purpose of the survey was to: (1) assess the level of compliance and/or non-compliance throughout the City regarding PPAs; (2) establish a baseline from which to measure an increase in compliance by departments; (3) determine if adequate training was available to implement the mandatory PPA Program; (4) solicit feedback regarding suggestions for additional trainings; and (5) gather data about systems being utilized by departments to track the PPA process.

The survey was sent to 50 City departments, of which 50 departments responded.

Note: The figures below reflect what was self-reported by the various City Departments as of early 2006 (from January through March, depending on when the Department responded to the survey). The information provided was not verified through independent means. The following is a summary from the information received:

1. Level of Compliance

The level of compliance regarding the implementation of PPAs varied throughout the City, from a range of no compliance to 100% compliance.

0 – 20% completed	21 – 40% completed	41 – 60% completed	61 – 80% completed	81 – 100% completed
Adult Probation	Academy of Sciences	Asian Art Museum	Administrative Services	Airport Commission *
Art Commission	Controller	Children/Families Comm	Animal Care & Control	Board of Supervisors *
Assessor-Recorder	Retirement	Health Service System	Building Inspection	Children Youth Families
City Planning	War Memorial	MTA	Environment	Child Support Services
District Attorney		Public Health	Fine Arts Museum	City Attorney
Elections		Sheriff	Fire	Civil Service Comm *
Ethics			Juvenile Probation	Emergency Comm
Human Rights Comm			Mayor's Office	Human Resources
Public Finance			Port	Human Services
Rent Arbitration Board			PUC	Medical Examiner
			Public Works	Permit Appeals *
			Recreation & Park	Police
			Taxi Commission	Public Defender *
				Public Library
				Status of Women *
				Telecom & Info Services
				Treasurer/Tax Collector

* 100% compliance

Compliance determined by number of employees who should have had a PPA and received an appraisal and the number of employees who actually had a PPA and appraisal.

2. Department Head PPAs

Departments were asked whether the Department Head received a PPA and if so, who performed it.

None	Review-Commission	Review – Other	Elected Official
Art Commission	Airport Commission	Academy of Sciences - ?	Assessor-Recorder
Asian Art Museum	Building Inspection	Adult Probation – Judges	Board of Supervisors
Administrative Services	Civil Service Commission	Animal Care & Control – ADM	City Attorney
Child Support Services	Elections	Board of Supervisors – Pres Bd	District Attorney
Children/Families Commission	Fine Arts Museum	Controller - Mayor	Mayor
Children Youth Families	Fire	Emergency Comm – Mayor	Public Defender
City Planning	Health Service System	Public Health – Mayor	Sheriff
Environment	Human Rights Commission	War Memorial – Trustees	Treasurer/Tax Collector
Ethics	Human Services		
Human Resources	MTA		
Juvenile Probation	Police		
Medical Examiner	Recreation & Park		
Permit Appeals	Retirement		
Port	Status of Women		
Public Finance			
Public Library			
PUC			
Public Works			
Rent Arbitration Board			
Taxi Commission			
Telecom & Info Services			

3. Time Measurements for PPA (some departments no response because PPAs not performed to date)

The time measurements covered by the PPA had wide variances throughout the City, with some departments having a combination of measurements.

Fiscal Year	Employee Anniversary Date	Calendar Year	Combination
Adult Probation	Animal Care & Control	Controller	Academy of Sciences
Airport Commission	Board of Supervisors	Health Service System	Administrative Services
Art Commission	Building Inspection	Human Resources	City Attorney
Asian Art Museum	Child Support Services	Mayor	Fire
Civil Service Commission	Children/Families Comm	Permit Appeals	Human Rights Commission
Elections	Children Youth Families	Public Defender	MTA
Ethics Commission	Emergency Commission	War Memorial	Public Health
Fine Arts Museum	Environment		Public Library
Medical Examiner	Human Services		
Port	Juvenile Probation		
PUC	Police		
Public Works	Retirement		
Recreation & Park	Sheriff		
Status of Women	Treasurer/Tax Collector		
Taxi Commission			
Telecom & Info Services			

4. Forms Utilized (some departments no response because PPAs not performed to date)

35 Departments use the current DHR form for their PPAs; 13 Departments use an old DHR version of the form and/or their own form. (the Board of Supervisors, Fire and Police are listed in both categories).

Old DHR Form

Airport Commission – old DHR form; the managers were trained on that form

Public Works – old DHR form for non-supervisors & first level supervisors; own narrative appraisal form for second level and higher supervisors; licensed employees and managers

Emergency Communications – old DHR form; supervisors “comfortable” with form

Telecom & Info Services –

Own Form

Asian Art Museum – own form to be utilized by both City employees and Foundation employees

Board of Supervisors – current DHR form for non-management employees; memo format for management

City Attorney – own form to address legal professionals

Fire – current DHR form for civilian employees; unique form for each rank of firefighters

Public Defender – own form due to specific job requirements

Police – current DHR form for civilian employees; separate form for sworn personnel

PUC – own form; preferred by PUC management

Retirement – own form

Sheriff – currently developing new form

5. Department Objectives Incorporated in PPA

The majority of departments incorporate the department’s mission, objectives from a strategic plan and/or specific division goals, where appropriate, into the employee’s PPA. Some departments (DHR & REC) enter the department’s objectives on the department’s PPA template. For managers, some departments (AIR & CON) incorporate the manager’s objectives from the Pay for Performance Plan. For sworn personnel (FIR), objectives for each rank are incorporated into the PPA.

6. Professional Development Objectives Incorporated in PPA

The majority of departments encourage their employees to attend trainings, workshops and conferences. However, some departments do more than that. For example, in departments which have mandatory continuing education requirements (CAT), the department implements a comprehensive education program for its employees. Other departments (ANC, CME & CSS) search for outside professional development opportunities and inform their employees about those. In REC, the supervisors/managers monitor the employees’ progress and information about learning opportunities are distributed throughout the year. The CON has a training coordinator for each of its divisions, who tracks employee training. Additionally, \$250 is offered per employee, for professional development. The CON also has a brown bag committee that offers lunchtime discussions about various topics, including career building.

7. Repercussions for Not Completing the PPA in a Timely Manner

Of the 38 departments who responded to this question, 18 departments stated that the completion of PPAs was incorporated in the supervisor/manager’s own PPA and would be impacted if not completed. 4 departments stated that their managers are counseled by his/her supervisor. 1 department stated that if the supervisor/manager was eligible for Pay for Performance, his/her rates could be lowered; 1 department stated that the supervisor/manager is denied times off until the PPAs are completed and 1 department has it documented in his/her personnel file. 5 departments had no repercussions and the remaining 8 responding departments had repercussions that were not clearly defined.

8. Additional PPA Training

From January 2005 to January 2006, DHR has trained over 300 supervisors/managers in the PPA process. However, there are still a number of individuals that need training. The following is a list of departments that need PPA training. (see attached spreadsheet re: listing of past PPA trainings by department)

Department	Number of Supervisors/Managers	Comments
Academy of Sciences	Yes	No number specified
Adult Probation	88	
Animal Care & Control	3	
Assessor-Recorder	20	Currently a Special Project with WD
Building Inspection	8-10	
City Planning	31-35	Starting a Special Project with WD
Controller	5-10	
Elections	15	
Ethics	Yes	No number specified
Fine Arts Museum	10	
Human Rights Commission	3-7	
Juvenile Probation	10-12	
MTA	Yes	Currently a Special Project with WD
Police	20	
Port	Yes	No number specified
Public Finance	1	
Public Health	Yes	No number specified
Public Library	50	
Recreation & Park	140	Currently a Special Project with WD
Treasurer/Tax Collector	50+	Recent Completion of Special Project with WD
War Memorial	8-10	

9. Suggestions for Other Trainings

The following is a list of suggested additional trainings. The majority of these trainings are currently being offered by DHR.

List of Topics

- Coaching/Counseling Skills *
- How to Deal with Difficult Employees *
- How to Write Constructive Criticism
- Communication Skills *
- Video or On-Line Training
- Team Building
- Managing Performance *
- New Supervisor Training *
- Writing *
- Refresher Supervisor/Manager Training
- Writing Job Objectives (incorporated in current PPA workshop)
- Time Management *

A list of additional topics from CON

- How to Get Things Done in the City **
- Open House-City Orientation **
- Leadership & Team Building *
- Interpersonal Skills

- Career Building
- Customer & Public Service *
- Civil Service Rules *
- Compliance (?)
- Communication, Reports & Terminology in CCSF
- Shadowing/Cross-Training
- Public Speaking *
- Telephone Etiquette *
- Presentation Skills *
- Writing Skills *
- Individual Personal Development
- How to Access Information in the Administrative Code
- How to Address Sunshine Requests
- Conflict of Interest & Independence
- MOU Overview **
- How to Conduct Effective Meetings *
- Disaster Training **
- Professional Workplace Behavior/Etiquette
- Stress Management *
- SF Stat (?)
- Interviewing Skills
- Budget Process
- Project Planning
- Facilitation Skills *

* Currently being offered in DHR Training Schedule

** Planning for 2006-07 Workshop Offering

10. Suggestions for Other Tools That Would be Helpful for PPA Process

- DHR to go to the department to present the PPA overview to the entire Staff
- Price breaks/Free training re: mandatory trainings
- Free workshops at venues on a larger scale (i.e., sexual harassment prevention)
- Tracking system to be informed of PPA completion deadlines
- What key objectives are reviewed for, how to express and understand them
- In-house reinforcement of training
- Handbooks
- Reward system for measurable, well documented performance that exceeds standards
- Standardized forms
- Benchmark standards for an entire department
- Access to employee attendance

11. Tracking System for PPA Process

The majority of departments have instituted some type of tracking system. The majority of departments need training to utilize PeopleSoft for tracking the PPAs. There were no responses from 4 Departments.

PeopleSoft	Access	Other	Excel	Manual	None
Admin Services	Airport	Asian Art – (HRIS)	Building Inspection	Animal Care & Con	Aca of Sciences
Fire	Board of Supervisor	Ch Sup Svc (Word)	Child/Fam Comm	Emergency Comm	Adult Probation
Human Resources	Public Library	Hum Svcs (own)	Children Youth Fam	Mayor	Art Commission
Medical Examiner	Public Works	Pub Health HR2000	Controller	Public Defender	Assessor-Recorder
	Rec & Park	Sheriff (Lotus)	District Attorney	Rent Arb Board	City Attorney
	Treasurer/Tax Coll		Elections	Status of Women	Civil Service (small)
			Environment	War Memorial	Ethics
			Fine Arts Museum		Human Rights
			Health Service Sys		Permit Appeals
			Juvenile Probation		Police
			MTA		Pub Finance
			Port		Taxi Commission
			PUC		
			Retirement		

12. Performance Measures

Starting FY 06-07, the Controller’s Office has issued new Performance Measures for each department regarding PPAs.

- Measure 1: Number of employees for whom performance appraisals were scheduled
 - This number is determined by the number of employees who should have performance plans in place within a specified period of time
- Measure 2: Number of employees for whom scheduled performance appraisals were completed
 - This number is determined by the number of employees who have a completed appraisal based upon a performance plan within a specified period of time
- DHR will work with the Controller’s Office to collect data for the measures and to calculate the percentage of scheduled appraisals completed.

The Performance Measures are completed within the following time periods

- January: report 6-month actual (July to December)
- August: report 12-month actual (July to June)

Example: Department X has 100 employees and measures PPAs by the Employee Anniversary Date. All employees have a performance plan that was completed. Between July and December 40 employees were scheduled (annual review period), but only 20 had a completed appraisal. Measure 1: 40 and Measure 2: 20 - this would equal 50% compliance for the 6-month actual period.

For the period July 1 through December 2005, 74% of scheduled appraisals were completed Citywide.

For the period July 1 2005 through June 30, 2006, Departments project that 89% of scheduled appraisals will be completed Citywide.

The target for FY 06-07 is 100% of scheduled appraisals to be completed Citywide.

13. Recommendations

A. Department Head Leadership

- Ensure department ownership and reinforcement for the PPA Program.
- For departments with a 0-60% completion rate, follow-up with specific department to ensure department ownership of PPA program. Confirm that all direct reports of department head/executive management team have PPAs
- For departmental PPA training, encourage department heads/executive management to attend and make a brief presentation. Confirm PPA completion and follow-up by department heads/executive management

B. 90-100% Compliance Goal

- Establish a goal for all departments to ensure a 90-100% completion by July 2007.
- Offer follow-up and additional assistance to Departments not meeting compliance goals.

C. Standardized Forms

- The purpose of the PPA Program is to ensure that an appraisal system is in place that leads to high performance in the departments. The PPA form on the DHR website is the standard form that DHR utilizes to train supervisors. This form was developed to assist supervisors/managers in linking objectives and goals to performance in order for the department to achieve its goals.
- However, departments may utilize their own PPA forms to meet this need. If a department utilizes its own form and wants to change to the DHR template, the WD training staff will be available for consultation to assist the department to accomplish this.

D. Training Opportunities

- Increase WD training opportunities for departments by offering PPA training at no cost (general workshops).
- Encourage departments to implement PPA trainings for all of their management staff in a workshop designed specifically for the department (for a fee).
- Work with executive management of the department and, if requested, WD trainers to give an overview to the PPA process for the entire staff of the department.

E. Tracking PPAs

- Institute a tracking system and a calendar follow-up system in PeopleSoft.
- Establish PeopleSoft training for this module.
- Implement training program for PeopleSoft and PPAs.

F. Rewards System

- Develop a Reward System for employees who consistently “exceed expectations” in their PPAs.

G. Department Accountability

- DHR be given authority to follow-up with City departments (randomly selected) in August 2006 and September 2007 to review status of PPA Program.
- DHR to issue a PPA Report to the Mayor and Board of Supervisors regarding the status of implementation of the PPA Program city-wide.
- Special recognition for those departments who reach 90-100% compliance in FY 06-07.

H. Additional Tools

- Suggestion: Departments plan a follow-up with supervisors who have participated in a PPA workshop
 - one day (or half day) workshop in which all supervisors will work on writing job descriptions and/or objectives
 - DHR training staff will be available to assist (fee)
 - additional half-day workshop in which DHR training staff will lead a Difficult Conversation workshop (during period of mid-reviews and/or annual reviews; fee)
- DHR to offer additional Communications/Difficult Conversations workshops targeted during period of mid-reviews and/or annual reviews (fee)
- City-wide distribution of "Phrase Book" for appraisals

I. Best Practices

- Draw best practices from various City departments and distribute City-wide
 - Meeting with Departments who indicated 81-100% compliance.
- Obtain additional information from Child Support Services regarding their ad-hoc committee established within the department to implement the PPA Program.